

Peel District School Board ARC (2012-01-24)

Park Royal (Clarkson) & Erin Mills (Erindale)

Issues:

- 1. ARC Process and Number of School Closures**
- 2. ARC Structure and Voting Process**
- 3. Misrepresenting Community Preferences**
- 4. Issue - Financial Accountability**
- 5. Trustees Prohibit Identifying/Analyzing Viable Alternative ?**

Attachments:

- 1. Rejection Criteria in Final ARC Report (Oct 14 2011)**
- 2. Valuation checklist.**
- 3. Erin Mills closure scenarios**

dan.anderson@sympatico.ca

Rejection Criteria (see pages 15-16 of report):

(Rejections actually occurred by bulk non-representative voting
rather than rejections specifically criteria-based.)

1. Enrolment in some schools exceeds max of 600.
2. Enrolment in some schools lower than preferred (non-specific).
3. Some school sites had "limitations".
4. Geographic location of some schools is non-optimal re bussing, etc.
5. Some schools have higher renovation costs.
6. (enrolment - general effect is repeat of rejection criteria #2)
7. (proximity to community resources - poorly applied in report)
8. Boundaries not "ideal" or would alter existing school families.

Community Input / Understanding

| item # in ARC checklist | Towards Understanding Key Elements From ARC VALUATION CHECKLIST <u>Equal</u> weighting for each item listed below (Yes-5%, No-0%) | YES/NO sample scenario |
|---|---|------------------------------|
| source: http://www.peelschools.org/facts/documents/ClarksonErindaleARC_valuation_checklist.pdf | | |
| (13) | Maximizes use of facilities ? (this seems to be only criteria dealing directly with minimizing capacity relative to student count) (Yes 5% / No 0%) | NO |
| (9) | Enhances parental involvement ? (Yes 5% / No 0%) | YES |
| (6) | Close to public library and community centre ? (Yes 5% / No 0%) | YES |
| (2) | "Enhances the teaching and learning experience" ? (Yes 5% / No 0%) | YES |
| (5) | Increases resources ? (Yes 5% / No 0%) | YES |
| (17) | Good geographic location of schools within community ? (Yes 5% / No 0%) | YES |
| (11) | Can "most" (over 50%?) students walk to school ? (Yes 5% / No 0%) | YES |
| (3) | Quality staffing for co-curricular programs ? (Yes 5% / No 0%) | YES |
| (1) | Quality spaces for: a) outdoor rec, b) full day KG, c) specialized classes ? | YES |
| (10) | Diverse student population ? (Yes 5% / No 0%) | YES |
| (4) | Diverse student social groupings ? (Yes 5% / No 0%) | YES |
| (12) | Diverse student population ? (Yes 5% / No 0%) | YES |
| (14) | Land/layout appropriate for necessary renovations ? (Yes 5% / No 0%) | YES |
| (8) | Quality location for special education spaces ? (Yes 5% / No 0%) | YES |
| (16) | Adequate space for vehicle traffic, parking, etc at school ? (Yes 5% / No 0%) | YES |
| (15) | Reasonable cost to upgrade ? (Yes 5% / No 0%) | YES |
| (7) | Ramps, elevators etc for disabled students ? (Yes 5% / No 0%) | YES |
| (20) | Retains lunch programs, day care, etc to support working parents, etc. | YES |
| (19) | Attracts/retains families in communities ? (Yes 5% / No 0%) | YES |
| (18) | Adequate space for vehicle etc. traffic through community ? (Yes 5% / No 0%) | YES |

Yes item above > 19

Sample Result = 19 x 5% = > 95%

The presentation of above items illustrates various issues regarding the content/use of the checklist.

Community Input & Summary of ARC Scenarios @2011-05-19 (revised 2011-05-24)

Sorted by Number of Closures

| | | Erindale | | | | | | | 2012 | | | 2020 | | |
|---|---|---|------------|----------|------------|--------------|------------------|--------------|----------------|----------------|----------|-----------------------------|----------|-----------------------------|
| | | # schools closed | Erin Mills | Ashgrove | Brookmeade | Garthwood Pk | Kling's Mastling | Pheasant Run | Sawmill Valley | Total Capacity | Students | ratio: students to capacity | Students | ratio: students to capacity |
| Current Status | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Capacity (without portables) | 0 | 522 | 187 | 414 | 400 | 299 | 150 | 371 | 2,343 | | | | | |
| Grades | | 6-8 | K-5 | K-5 | K-5 | K-5 | K-5 | K-6 | | | | | | |
| Students 2012 | 0 | 347 | 216 | 268 | 316 | 165 | 210 | 276 | | 1,798 | 77% | | | |
| Students 2020 | 0 | 273 | 181 | 279 | 280 | 161 | 193 | 236 | | | | 1,603 | 68% | |
| Scenario # | | Scenarios below assume Ashgrove & Garthwood Park 6-8 no longer bussed to Hillside. Student counts should include junior kindergarten & special needs students, as applicable? | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| There seems to potentially be a notable degree of confusion and chaos in the committee's 40+ closure scenarios presented to the public through wall displays at the May 19 public meeting. In general it seems that the public is relying on the deliberations by the committee, rather than any meaningful expectation at this stage that the public is the architect for the scenario set under consideration. The criteria used and the sources for the various scenarios are unclear, but as noted below, the scenario set does not seem representative of the more fundamental closure scenarios that a school community would expect to be considered, while there appears to be a bias towards maximizing the number of school closures in 2011. | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| E-25 | 2 | | K-5 | K-5 | 6-8 | | K-5 | K-8 | | 1,522 | 2,268 | 149% | 2,014 | 132% |
| E-09 | 3 | 6-8 | | K-5 | K-8 | | | K-5 | | 1,707 | 2,269 | 133% | 2,014 | 118% |
| E-41 | 3 | 6-8 | | K-5 | K-5 | | | K-8 | | 1,707 | 2,494 | 146% | 2,014 | 118% |
| E-15 | 4 | 6-8 | | K-8 | K-8 | | | | | 1,336 | 2,269 | 170% | 2,014 | 151% |
| The above are the only four scenarios that consider the alternative of regional programs that add additional students. | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| E-38 | 1 | | K-8 | K-8 | K-8 | K-8 | K-8 | K-8 | | 1,821 | 2,044 | 112% | 1,790 | 98% |
| Not considered | 1 | 6-8 | K-5 | K-5 | K-5 | | K-5 | K-5 | | 2,044 | 2,269 | 111% | 2,014 | 99% |
| Not considered | 1 | 6-8 | K-5 | K-5 | K-5 | K-5 | | K-5 | | 2,193 | 2,269 | 103% | 2,014 | 92% |
| Not considered | 1 | 6-8 | | K-5 | K-5 | K-5 | K-5 | K-5 | | 2,156 | 2,269 | 105% | 2,014 | 93% |
| Not considered | 1 | 6-8 | K-5 | K-5 | K-5 | K-5 | K-5 | | | 1,972 | 2,269 | 115% | 2,014 | 102% |
| Not considered | 1 | 6-8 | K-5 | | K-5 | K-5 | K-5 | K-5 | | 1,929 | 2,269 | 118% | 2,014 | 104% |
| Not considered | 1 | 6-8 | K-5 | K-5 | | K-5 | K-5 | K-5 | | 1,943 | 2,269 | 117% | 2,014 | 104% |
| Apparently only a single one-school-closure scenario is under consideration by the committee, with no consideration of other scenarios with only a single school closure, with or without adding a regional program to EM while selectively changing other schools from K-5 to K-6 and adjusting school boundaries. There seems to be a bias towards closing 2 or more schools here. The ARC's "scenario builder" did not allow for changing K-5 to K-6, although that approach is used in some scenarios below. | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| E-24 | 2 | | K-5 | K-8 | K-5 | | K-8 | K-8 | | 1,522 | 2,044 | 134% | 1,790 | 118% |
| E-34 | 2 | 6-8 | K-5 | K-5 | K-5 | | | K-5 | | 1,894 | 2,044 | 108% | 1,790 | 95% |
| E-35 | 2 | 6-8 | K-5 | K-5 | K-5 | | | K-5 | | 1,894 | 2,044 | 108% | 1,790 | 95% |
| E-36 | 2 | 6-8 | K-5 | K-5 | K-5 | | | K-5 | | 1,894 | 2,044 | 108% | 1,790 | 95% |
| E-39 | 2 | 7-8 | K-6 | K-6 | K-6 | | | K-6 | | 1,894 | 2,044 | 108% | 1,790 | 95% |
| E-46 | 2 | 6-8 | K-5 | K-5 | K-5 | | | K-5 | | 1,894 | 2,044 | 108% | 1,790 | 95% |
| Not considered | 2 | Numerous other two-school scenarios, with or without addition of regional program. | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Notably, all of the two-school closures that do not include closing Erin Mills, have considered closing only the above two schools and no consideration of two-school closure scenarios that include adding students at Erin Mills through regional programs (and using K-6s). This approach seems to bias the deliberations against specific schools as well as biasing the deliberations towards closing 3 schools in the community. | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| E-02 | 3 | 6-8 | | K-5 | K-5 | | | K-5 | | 1,707 | 2,044 | 120% | 1,790 | 105% |
| E-04 | 3 | 6-8 | | | K-5 | K-5 | | K-5 | | 1,592 | 2,044 | 128% | 1,790 | 112% |
| E-05 | 3 | 6-8 | | K-5 | K-5 | | | K-5 | | 1,707 | 2,044 | 120% | 1,790 | 105% |
| E-06 | 3 | 6-8 | | K-5 | K-5 | | | K-5 | | 1,486 | 2,044 | 138% | 1,790 | 120% |
| E-07 | 3 | 6-8 | | | K-5 | K-5 | | K-5 | | 1,443 | 2,044 | 142% | 1,790 | 124% |

Community Input & Summary of ARC Scenarios @2011-05-19 (revised 2011-05-24)

Sorted by Number
of Closures

| | | Erindale | | | | | | | 2012 | | 2020 | | | |
|------------------------------|---|------------------|------------|----------|------------|--------------|----------------|--------------|----------------|----------------|----------|-----------------------------|----------|-----------------------------|
| | | # schools closed | Erin Mills | Ashgrove | Brookmeade | Garthwood Pk | King's Masting | Pheasant Run | Sawmill Valley | Total Capacity | Students | ratio: students to capacity | Students | ratio: students to capacity |
| Current Status | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Capacity (without portables) | 0 | 522 | 187 | 414 | 400 | 299 | 150 | 371 | 2,343 | | | | | |
| Grades | | 6-8 | K-5 | K-5 | K-5 | K-5 | K-5 | K-6 | | | | | | |
| Students 2012 | 0 | 347 | 216 | 268 | 316 | 165 | 210 | 276 | | 1,798 | 77% | | | |
| Students 2020 | 0 | 273 | 181 | 279 | 280 | 161 | 193 | 236 | | | | 1,603 | 68% | |
| cont'd | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| E-10 | 3 | 6-8 | | | K-8 | K-5 | | K-5 | 1,592 | 2,044 | 128% | 1,790 | 112% | |
| E-11 | 3 | 7-8 | | K-6 | K-6 | | | K-6 | 1,707 | 2,044 | 120% | 1,790 | 105% | |
| E-12 | 3 | 7-8 | | K-6 | K-8 | | | K-6 | 1,707 | 2,044 | 120% | 1,790 | 105% | |
| E-16 | 3 | 6-8 | | K-5 | K-5 | | | K-5 | 1,486 | 2,044 | 138% | 1,790 | 120% | |
| E-17 | 3 | 6-8 | | K-5 | K-5 | | | K-6 | 1,707 | 2,044 | 120% | 1,790 | 105% | |
| E-18 | 3 | 6-8 | | K-5 | K-5 | | | K-5 | 1,707 | 2,044 | 120% | 1,790 | 105% | |
| E-21 | 3 | | K-8 | K-8 | K-8 | | | K-8 | 1,372 | 2,044 | 149% | 1,790 | 130% | |
| E-23 | 3 | 6-8 | K-5 | | K-5 | | | K-5 | 1,480 | 2,044 | 138% | 1,790 | 121% | |
| E-28 | 3 | 6-8 | K-5 | | | | | K-5 | 1,230 | 2,044 | 166% | 1,790 | 146% | |
| E-29 > selected ?! > | 3 | 6-8 | | K-5 | K-5 | | | K-5 | 1,707 | 2,044 | 120% | 1,790 | 105% | |
| E-30 | 3 | 6-8 | | K-5 | K-5 | | | K-5 | 1,707 | 2,044 | 120% | 1,790 | 105% | |
| E-31 | 3 | 6-8 | K-5 | | K-5 | | | K-5 | 1,480 | 2,044 | 138% | 1,790 | 121% | |
| E-32 | 3 | 6-8 | K-5 | | K-5 | | | K-5 | 1,480 | 2,044 | 138% | 1,790 | 121% | |
| E-33 | 3 | 6-8 | K-5 | | K-5 | | | K-5 | 1,480 | 2,044 | 138% | 1,790 | 121% | |
| E-37 | 3 | | K-8 | K-8 | K-8 | | | K-8 | 1,372 | 2,044 | 149% | 1,790 | 130% | |
| E-42 | 3 | 6-8 | | K-5 | K-5 | | | K-5 | 1,707 | 2,044 | 120% | 1,790 | 105% | |
| E-43 | 3 | 6-8 | K-5 | | K-5 | | | K-5 | 1,480 | 2,044 | 138% | 1,790 | 121% | |
| E-44 | 3 | 6-8 | | K-5 | K-5 | K-5 | | | 1,635 | 2,044 | 125% | 1,790 | 109% | |
| E-45 | 3 | 6-8 | | K-5 | K-5 | | | K-5 | 1,486 | 2,044 | 138% | 1,790 | 120% | |
| E-01 | 4 | 6-8 | | | | K-5 | K-5 | | 971 | 2,044 | 211% | 1,790 | 184% | |
| E-03 | 4 | 6-8 | | K-5 | K-5 | | | | 1,336 | 2,044 | 153% | 1,790 | 134% | |
| E-08 | 4 | 6-8 | | K-5 | K-5 | | | | 1,336 | 2,044 | 153% | 1,790 | 134% | |
| E-19 | 4 | 6-8 | | K-5 | | | | K-5 | 1,307 | 2,044 | 156% | 1,790 | 137% | |
| E-20 | 4 | | | K-8 | K-8 | | | K-8 | 1,185 | 2,044 | 172% | 1,790 | 151% | |
| E-22 | 4 | K-8 | | K-8 | K-8 | | | | 1,336 | 2,044 | 153% | 1,790 | 134% | |
| E-26 | 4 | | | K-8 | K-8 | | | K-8 | 964 | 2,044 | 212% | 1,790 | 186% | |
| E-27 | 4 | 6-8 | | | K-5 | | | K-5 | 1,293 | 2,044 | 158% | 1,790 | 138% | |
| E-40 | 4 | | | K-8 | K-8 | | | K-8 | 1,185 | 2,044 | 172% | 1,790 | 151% | |
| E-13 | 5 | | | K-8 | K-8 | | | | 814 | 2,044 | 251% | 1,790 | 220% | |
| E-14 | 5 | K-8 | K-8 | | | | | | 709 | 2,044 | 288% | 1,790 | 252% | |